

REVIEW

By Prof. Dimitar Tenchev, *University of Chemical Technology and Metallurgy – Sofia*, 3.8 Economics and Management, assigned to be a member of the Academic Panel, under Ordinance 3-PK-258/17.06.2022 by the Rector of NBU, reviewing the academic work submitted for the contest for the academic position Professor in professional field 3.7. Administration and Management (Managing Virtual Teams), as announced in SG, issue 08/28.01.2022, candidate:
Assoc. Prof. Kristiyan Stoyanov Hadzhiev, PhD

I. Assessment for conformity with the minimum national requirements and requirements of the New Bulgarian University

To participate in the contest for the academic position *Professor*, Assoc. Prof. **Kristiyan Stoyanov Hadzhiev, PhD** has presented self-assessment and evidence, fully comply with the provisions of national law and with the regulatory documents of NBU.

With its activities **Kristiyan Stoyanov Hadzhiev, PhD** has met the minimum requirements for scientific and teaching activities for field three. Social, business, and legal sciences, professional field 3.7. Administration and Management, laid out in The Implementation Rules for Development of Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria Act (DASRBA), as well as the requirements of the Ordinance on the development NBU Faculty, that are to be met by candidates for the academic position Professor. The points on all indicators significantly exceed the minimum required number of points.

Group A (earned points: 50 out of required minimum number of 50 points)

Indicator 1 (Dissertation Paper):

He has earned his NBU Doctoral Degree (Diploma with Registry No.: 018/2004) issued by VAK, 2009, Scientific Specialization 05.02.20 Social Management (Diploma with Registry No.: 33037/06.04.2009) with a defended doctoral thesis themed *Designing Excellent Organizations*, academic supervisor Assoc. Prof. Ruslan Penchev, PhD, reviewers: Prof. Asen Kovachev, DSc, Assoc. Prof. Evangeliy Andronov, PhD, amounting to 190

Group B (earned points: 100 out of required minimum number of 100 points)

Indicator 3 (Habilitation paper - Monograph):

The Candidate has written a habilitation paper, a Monograph: Hadzhiev, K., *Virtual Team Management (Theory and Methodology)*. Sofia, NBU, 2021, 407 c., ISBN 978-619-233-160-3, Reviewers: prof Galina Georgieva Kurteva, PhD, prof Asen Kovachev, DSc, Prof. Asen Kovachev, DSc; Academic Editor: Assoc. Prof. Dimitar Panayotov, PhD.

Group C (earned points: 366, out of required minimum number of 100 points)

Indicator 5 (Published book based on defended dissertation paper):

Hadzhiev, K., *Designing Superb Organizations*. Sofia., Publisher: Lyuren, 2000, 224 c., ISBN 954-568-062-8, Reviewer: Prof. Kamen Kamenov, DSc

Indicator 7 (Articles and reports in unrefereed publications with scientific review or edited collective volumes)

Twenty-six publications are presented. They are divided in two main fields, which I would define as

In general, *Organizational Management* – publications 1, 3,4 8, 12, 15, 16,19, 23, 24, in total eleven publications

Managing People and Teams – publications 2,5, 6, 7, 9, 13, 18, 20, 21, 22, 25, 26, in total twelve

The candidate's research interests are also in the field of *Quality and Competitiveness Management* (Publications 10, 11, 17, as well as *e-learning* – publication 14).

Indicator 9 (Publications in non-refereed journals with scientific review)

There are four publications presented.

Indicator 10 (Published chapter of a collective monograph)

Hadzhiev, K., Koteva, N., Alexiev, A. Uzunova, P., Hadzhichoneva, Y., Georgiev, A. *Competitiveness of Agricultural Enterprises in Bulgaria, and Models for Improvement*: monograph (chapter 1), Publisher: Avantgarde Prima, Sofia, 2021, ISBN - 978-619-239-561-2, COBISS.BG-ID – 46792200 Scientific reviewers: prof Yulia Doychinova, DSc, Assoc. Prof. Bozhidar Ivanov, PhD

Group D (earned points: 580, out of required minimum number of 100 points), of which for Indicator 12, there are – 450 points (there are seventy noted citations of the applicant)

Group E Total 250.6 points out of the required minimum of 100 points (Indicator 16, earned points: 120 from participating in eight projects; Indicator 20 – 130.6 points from six projects)

Group F (earned points: 150, out of required minimum number of 70 points)

Group G (earned points: 120, out of required minimum number of 70 points)

Group H (earned points: 90, out of required minimum number of 70 points)

I avoid specifying the number of points on each of the indicators from 11 to 49, so as not to repeat data, available in the applicant's self-assessment.

The total number of points, that can be seen in Kristiyan Hadzhiev's self-assessment is 1707.

II. Research (creative) activities and results

1. Evaluation of monograph work, creative performances or other publications corresponding in volume and integrity to the monograph, including evaluation of the scientific and applied contributions of the author.

The monograph presented, *Managing Virtual Teams*, is developed in twelve chapters amounting to 407 pages. The number of sources referenced is also significant – 218 sources. In addition to its research nature, I could say that it also has a methodological focus in its final parts in terms of helping employers in organizing a modern form of structuring of their organizations. In this respect, it is also obvious that the monograph is in a way building up on Assoc. Prof. Hadzhiev's in the context of organizational management - the area of his dissertation work. The fields integrated in his monograph also include Business Excellence, the modern aspects of quality management as well as competitiveness and the design principle of the implementation of the activity in the companies. By its nature, this scientific work transcends the limits of an ordinary monograph, approaching in its significance to the parameters of a major doctoral thesis.

The main aspects of the work are arranged in logical order and developed in a systematic, comprehensive, and relevant structure. Starting with the purely theoretical aspects of the team, as the main structural unit in organizations, the work lays out a detailed account of the classical management theory and the knowledge in the development of human relationships and adequately outlines the prospects for human resources, as an indispensable factor in the overall labor scheme, productivity, competitiveness, etc.

Modern business conditions – information support, strongly linked to the digitization of life, the globalization, the fierce competition in the sectors, the risk and uncertainty and the challenges, resulting from them, are relevantly intertwined into the characteristics and functions of virtual teams, outlined in the monograph, as a means of achieving high efficiency, effectiveness and outstanding performance of organizations.

The different approaches to management (the systematic, the process and situational approach in the management of are addressed through the prism of the new forms of organization of the activity and in particular with correct identification of the role and place of the virtual teams in them. Chapter Four comprehensively systematizes and analyses the team patterns from their initial form to virtual parameters, outlining the characteristics of VT, the way they are formed, the goals, tasks, expectations, etc. The VT patterns outlined on the next pages, emphasize their importance, by providing additional detail about their functionality and working capacity. Based on what has been done so far, the author has successfully built a conceptual integrative model for managing the effectiveness of VT.

In the following chapters, Assoc. Prof. Hadzhiev focuses on the location and role of the team in the working processes in a contact and virtual environment. The motivational factors, the role of talents, the resource assurance of the activity in the specifics of the VT are relevantly outlined.

Social relationships are also considered important in the monograph, the emotional intelligence of team members, coordination of work, knowledge management (obvious, shared, hidden), creating and increasing trust between people, communicating with factors outside the team.

It is logical that in his monograph, the author also discusses the VT leadership and its specificities in this context. I believe that this emphasis is relevantly interpreted in the holistic view of the management of organizations, As of the details about VT they do complement the existing knowledge and experience in this area and I think this is a significant contribution.

An integral part of team management, including that of virtual teams, is the setting of targets as an essential element of the Management by Objectives approach, through which factors such as effectiveness and efficiency, which are addressed in the latest chapters of the European.

In my opinion, monographic work has a substantial scientifically applied contribution in several aspects, author himself in the Reference for original scientific contributions to habilitation work. I fully agree with this structure, but I would add another one, namely the new dimensions of leadership in VT, considering the peculiarities of virtual work – team members can be situated at different points in the world, not to meet physically and to rely on their high loyalty and responsibility to the activity, but the role of the leader in this is huge and relies on competence, charisma, emotional intelligence, skills for setting goals, delegation, and so on.

Regarding scientific contributions, I would fully agree with the claims made about them in the Report and would again add one more, in my view, essential.

Adequate integration of modern approaches into the organization management of – The System, Situational, Process, and Project Approaches with Parameters (actions, responsibilities, role, performance, effectiveness, efficiency, productivity, etc.) of VT.

In conclusion, in my opinion, the development is extremely relevant and meets the needs of modern times in terms of shifting paradigms in the management of both activity and management of people in organizations, achieving high competitiveness, adaptability, performance, etc.

2. Evaluation of contributions in other attached publications (creative performances), made after the appointment of the academic position Ch. Asst. Prof. or the academic position Assoc. Prof. (for Professorship candidates). It shall also include an assessment of the requirement to have the publications reviewed.

After having been appointed as an associate professor, as can be seen in the self-assessment provided, Kristiyan Hadzhiev has 366,4 points, while the required number is 200 for Group G indicators.

Based on the dissertation paper, there is a book published: Designing Excellent Organisations, Sofia, Publisher: *Lyuren* 2000, 224 s., ISBN 954-568-062-8, Reviewer: Prof. Kamen Kamenov, DSc

The applicant has published twenty-six academic paper and articles in non-refereed publications, of which seventeen from scientific conferences (of them one in English); in scientific journals – 5 (3 in English) and four in scientific journals abroad, all in English. In addition, four studies (published in edited collective volumes) have been submitted, one of which is in English.

In connection with **Indicator 10** (*Published chapter of collective monograph*), Kristiyan Hadzhiev has presented a chapter of collective monograph *Competitiveness of agricultural holdings in Bulgaria and models for its promotion in co-authorship* with Koteva, N. , Alexiev, A. Uzunova, R., Hadzhichoneva, U., Georgiev, A., Publisher: Avant-garde Prima, Sofia, 2021, ISBN - 978-619-239-561-2, COBISS. BG-ID – 46792200 and **Academic Reviewers:** Prof. Yulia Doychinova, DSc, Assoc. Prof. Bozhidar Ivanov, PhD.

I dare say that the study field in all publications – monograph, book, articles, reports, studio, in my opinion is organizational excellence in the context of organizational management and all publications in the other areas of scientific interests (management of people and teams, competitiveness, project management, e-learning, etc.) of the applicant complement, in an adequate way, the holistic nature of this modern approach.

There is a consistency in the candidate's scientific interests and research, which proves the targeted and consistent development of the candidate in the selected areas. All publications are relevant to the context of the announced competition – 3.7. Administration and Management.

I am taking the liberty to draw a few conclusions in relation to the scientific production presented.

- Each of the publications treats current problems and enriches the scientific and practical value of existing knowledge.
- Assoc. Prof. Hadzhiev's critical view and analysis is noticeable in all developments and this proves his consistent development as a researcher.
- The different areas of research build sustainable "bridges" in the Network of Administration and Management, enabling the deployment of new interconnections that complement understanding and practice in the management of organizations.
- The works are presented at high-level reputable forums and publications in the country and abroad and are disseminated among the academia.

What is also available, along with the scientific importance of the production is an essential practical and applied utility of the results.

3. Citation by other authors.

Kristiyan Hadzhiev's research work is popular among the academics and specialists in the field, as evidenced by the quotes provided in the self-assessment in indicators 11 and 12 of Group D, a total of 70 points as well as others, which are presented in the NBU Library Report.

This gives me a reason to confirm once again the consistency and adequacy of the developed materials – books, reports, and articles, and to share my positive assessment.

4. Evaluation of the results of the research work and participation in creative projects, as well as application of the results obtained in practice.

Assoc. Prof. Hadzhiev has participated in eight national scientific and educational projects, especially in the field of education and training, as well as in projects, focused on increasing the competitiveness of agricultural enterprises. The results of the work on the projects are presented as reports, articles, as well as other publications. These facts confirm the impression of a consistent, sustainable, and steady scientist and researcher.

Regarding Indicator 25, focused on the Professorship contest, Assoc. Prof. Hadzhiev has participated in the following projects:

1. Scientific and Practical Research Unit (SPRU) *Quantitative Methods and Modeling*. **The main** objective is to consolidate the scientific potential of the Department of Administration and Management and to build the capacity to provide advisory services and expertise in the management field.
2. **Establishing a SPRU Risk Management Laboratory and transforming it into a non-profit association Risk Analysis and Management Centre (RAMC)**. **The main** objective is to consolidate the scientific potential of four departments (*Business Administration, Economy, Political Science and National and International Security*) and to build capacity for the provision of advisory services and expertise in the field of risk management. The candidate is among the founders of the Centre and is a member of the board.
3. **Business Incubator**, in co-operation with the Bulgarian Red Cross. **The main** objective of the project is to allow marginalized people wishing to start their own business to develop their personal and professional qualities to improve their social status by creating their own independent working strategies, which will enable them to participate in the labor market.
4. **SPRU Training Firm. Main activities:** 1. Organizing teacher trainings for faculty from Business Administration and Economics departments, focusing on the **certification of TFs** by the International TF Organization; 2. Participation of the NBU Training Firms in the International TF Fairs (TF FEST *Young Entrepreneur* in Plovdiv; 3. Facilitating the work of three virtual TF in the national and **international** TF Network of TF; 4. **Certification** of the three virtual public structures on the basis of a specialized audit of the training and practical activities of the NBU training firms in accordance with the quality standards **of the Global Network of Training Firms -EUROPEN**
5. Developing a curriculum at the State Agency for Compulsory Vocational Training in *Organizational Management* – immediate result of the *Career Prospects Project* – to indicator - 16-6
6. **The Business Case Competition (BCC)** Developing a business case (BIZ Case Competition) and training of the participants in the local (intermediate national) round, and participation in the panel; the project is implemented by WUS – Austria, NBU is an institutional partner

The presented textbooks and teaching tools are also impressive – 6 in which Kristiyan Hadzhiev has integrated some of his knowledge, experience and expertise to help learners.

The applicant is a member of four national organizations and associations, indispensable in the professional field:

- The Advisory Board of the Risk Management Laboratory *transformed into the Risk Analysis and Management Centre (RAMC)*, NBU (2013- 2019)
- Advisory Board of *Laboratory of Quantitative Methods and Modeling* (from 2019-)

- Association of Lecturers in Economics and Management in the Industry (ALEM) – (since 2014-)
- Bulgarian People Management Association (BPMA)

In addition, he constantly shares his knowledge and experience in the university initiatives for the development of academic staff and as a moderator or consultant twice, and five times as a participant.

This demonstrates his strong motivation and commitment to disseminate his experience and knowledge, as well as to ensure their continuous improvement in the academic field. It is also evidence of recognition of his excellence in these circles.

It is obvious that Assoc. Prof. Hadzhiev has the potential for both future self-development and continuing to help enrich science and practice in the field of scientific interests. I would also like to point out the significance and the importance of the problems resulting from the dynamic, unpredictable business environment, as well as the necessity for the management to adapt quickly through applying highly efficient forms of organizing the activities, which is the focus of the candidate's future scientific and research plans.

All this is declared in its Research Program and is tied to results achieved so far (submission of the documents for participation in the competition).

III. Teaching and teaching activities

1. Lecture courses and training courses, working in the electronic training module MOODLE – NBU, provision of student practices and internships, working with students and PhD students.

Assoc. Prof. Hadzhiev is a member of the team that created the *BA Business Management and Entrepreneurship* – regular and distance learning; and of the team that created *MBA "Business Administration"* regular and distance learning.

He has developed and improved ten courses in the bachelor's program.

He has created or participated in the improvement of 7 courses in *MBA Business Administration*, among which MBAM174/MBAM165D Management Process and Team Work, MBAM170/MBAM177D Models of Organizational Excellence that are in line with the his research interests.

He has assisted in developing and improving the content of courses to two other master's programs – *Tourist Business Management* and *Luxury Hospitality Management*. The courses themselves again overlap with the scientific interests of the candidate – Managing People and Teams.

As a lecturer, apart from courses taught in Bulgarian, Kristiyan Hadzhiev also teaches five courses in the respective MBA: MHRE314 Project Management; MHRE416 Organizational Analysis, Design and Development; MHRE324 Project: *Project Development*; MSME026 Project: Business Plan Developing; MHRB315D Quality Management Standards, in English.

To support adequate student learning, Assoc. Prof. Kristiyan Hadzhiev, alone or in co-authorship, has developed and published four sets of teaching materials in paper form:

Hadzhiev, K. *Organization Theory*. Sofia., NBU 2011, 370 p., ISBN: 978-954-535-663-6 textbook for BA *Business Management and Entrepreneurship* on the BABB517/BUBB506D Organization Theory course, as well as multimedia e-textbook issued by NBU, 2014; <https://e-edu.nbu.bg/course/view.php?id=22965>

Hadzhiev, K. *Models for Organizational Excellence*. Sofia., NBU 2013, 342 p., ISBN 978-954-535-756-5 – textbook for MBA Business Administration regular and distance learning for courses: MBAM170/MBAM177D Models of Organizational Excellence; MBAM127/MBAM089D Project: *Models of Organizational Excellence*;

Kamenov, K., Hadzhiev, K., Marinova N. *Management Process and Team Work*. Sofia, NBU 2005, 291 pp. (Hadzhiev, K. – 115 pp. – topics: fifth, sixth and seventh and drafting of a glossary), ISBN: 954-535-418-6 – textbook for MP Business Administration regular and distance learning courses: MBAM174/MBAM165D Management process and team work; MBAM165/MBAM094D Project: Team Management; MBAM129 Seminar: Team Dynamics, Group Processes and Leadership (Research Studies);

Hadzhiev, K. and Human Resources Management Team (Chapter 6. Team Management (Team Performance Criteria), NBU, Department of Business Administration, 2014, p. 317-365, ISBN: 978-954-535-831-9

These plus two more:

Kamenov, K., Hadzhiev K. *Human Factor and Teamwork in Management*. Sofia, Publisher: *Lyuren* 2000, 174 pp., (Hadzhiev, K.: Chapters II and III – 60 pp.), ISBN: 954-568-064-4 and

Kamenov, K., Kr. Hadzhiev, A. Asenov *Man, Teams, Leaders*. Sofia, Publisher: *Lyuren*, 2000, 303 pp. (Hadzhiev, K. - Part II, Chapters VI, VII and VIII – 80 pp.), ISBN: 954-568-066-0
Also used for training and in the school network.

Two other electronic textbooks are integrated into the moodle platform – **Basics of Management – electronic textbook (2019) and multimedia e-textbook on** courses from BAEB006/BAEB301D/BUTB300/ BUTB301D Basics of Business Management and Project **Management – electronic textbook (2019) for BP Business Management and Entrepreneurship** for Courses: BABB843/BUBB804D Project Management, BATB826 Project Management in Tourism, BUBB806 Project and Program Management.

The candidate also maintains an active relationship with students, facilitating scientific research. There are three paper available because of the project work. The involvement of students in the training process is further conducted through organizing and conducting internships and practices in domestic businesses, as well as through facilitating their participation in creative competitions and events at national and international level.

Assoc. Prof. Hadzhiev has been the tutor of twenty-one graduates, who have successfully defended their diploma theses. He has reviewed seventeen students' papers at the pre-defense stage. He has been member of over 280 state exams panels. The average annual workload, consisting of teaching lecture and training courses significantly exceeds the required minimum.

All this gives me reason to believe that the candidate has an unobstructed vision and maintains a constant high level of student-oriented activity in the context of effective sharing of knowledge and experience with them. Based on the feedback shared by students and the resulting average grade (Very good 4,53 out of the maximum of 5,00) I could draw the conclusion, that they trust the candidate and acknowledge his efforts focused on their tuition and education with gratitude.

IV. Administrative and Social Work

1. Participation in collective NBU management bodies.

Assoc. Prof. Assoc. Prof. Hadzhiev actively participates in the NBU administration activities. He is head of Administration and Management Department since 2012, he is member of the Academic Council of NBU, he is Vice-President of the Faculty Council of the School of Distance, Online and Continuing Education since 2019; he has participated: in committees for the election of rector of the New Bulgarian University, pursuant to the Academic Council Decision #5 of 21 January 2020; in the commission for assessing the annual basic faculty workload for lecturers with employment contracts with the School of graduate studies; in the Project Assessment Panel for projects under the Study Programs within the School of Distance, Digital and Continuing Education; in panels the review of documents on advertised competitions for academic positions; the candidate, in his capacity of Head of Department, has also participated in the activities of the Strategic Issues Program Council. He participates regularly in all meetings of the operational units, he regularly conducts classes with students, no penalties are imposed.

1. Social activity.

In terms of his social activity, the candidate is undoubtedly active. I would mention the membership **of the Editorial Board of: The Annual Journal of the NBU Administration and Management Department since 2015; of the editorial board of Methodology, Interdisciplinarity, Analysis, Strategies”** (from the *Leadership, Society, Strategic Visions* series – a periodical of the NBU Administration and Management Department), as well as in the **editorial board of the Economic Thought magazine**, issued by the BAS Institute for Economic Research, since 2018.

In addition, he was in the role of President or Vice-President of nine international scientific conferences and three general university seminars. The latter are aimed at graduating students development, which once again reveals his active role in integrating young colleagues into the research life of NBU.

Furthermore, I would also like to point out yet another significant contribution, namely the creation and development of a team with a research focus in the field of corporate management, innovation management, public administration, tourism, hospitality and European transport policies, institutional experience, and sustainable development trends in EU Member States

In my opinion, through all these activities, Assoc. Prof. Hadzhiev tangibly supports the achievement of the objective of NBU continuously improve its performance nationally and internationally.

V. Personal impressions of the candidate (if any)

I have known Kristiyan Hadzhiev particularly in relation to his participation as a researcher in various specialized scientific forums, as well as through our joint efforts realized through participation in academic panels, focused on promoting young colleagues to doctoral

status. At each one of these occasions, he has exhibited extraordinary professionalism and has proven to be a consistent researcher and a devoted scientist. It is my conviction that his research interests and his work contribute significantly not only to the improvement the knowledge of the students, but also to the practice of the Bulgarian organizations.

VI. Opinions, recommendations and notes on the applicant's activities and achievements

I do not have any critical notes to share on the academic and research work submitted. I confirm my positive opinion on the quality of the candidate's publications. I would also add, that as a tutor, Assoc. Prof. Hadzhiev shows excellence and contributes to the continuous improvement of the quality of education in NBU.

I would take the liberty to propose that, Kristiyan Hadzhiev – in a future research project – try to to explore the impact of gender ideology on the effective and efficient management of virtual teams in the context of Business Excellence.

CONCLUSION

Based on what is set out here and as a result of an in-depth review of the parameters of the candidate’s social, academic, research, teaching, public and administrative activities, dare I claim that the candidate meets the requirements for being awarded the academic position Professor, in accordance with DASRBA, its Implementation Rules and the requirements by NBU. Therefore, I give my firm **POSITIVE assessment of the application**.

With all due respect, I will recommend to the Academic Panel to vote FOR and to propose to the NBU Academic Council to **award the academic position of Professor** in Professional Field 3.7 *Administration and Management*.

Date: August 2022
.....

Signature