

REVIEWS

by
Prof. Ph.D. Maria Stamatova Vodenska,
International Business School,
Specialty Tourism, Science 3.9 Tourism

on the scientific works of Head Assistant Professor Milena Metodieva
Karailieva
to participate in a competition for an academic position
"Associate Professor" in the professional field "3.9. Tourism
(Human Capital in Tourism),
published in the State Gazette, issue. No. 93/11/26/2019

The review was prepared in accordance with the requirements of the Law on the Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria (ZRASRB) and the Regulations for its Implementation (RAPRASRB) and the Regulation for the Development of the Academic Staff in the New Bulgarian University as a member of the Scientific Jury by Decision of 10.02.2020. It is made up of requirements for research, teaching, teaching, administrative and community service, recommendations and notes on its activities and achievements.

I. Assessment of compliance with national minimum requirements and the requirements of New Bulgarian University

The candidate for associate professor covers the minimum requirements for the scientific, teaching and / or creative activity of the candidates for the occupation of the academic positions in professional fields, in accordance with PPRASRB (groups of indicators A-E) and the corresponding number of points: A 50/50, B 100 / 100, D 510/200, D 125/50 and E 105 / 0, as well as reports on the fulfillment of criteria and indicators in the long-term certification for announcing a competition for a higher academic position, according to the current NBU ordinance - academic work, organizational work and community service (show groups bodies (ZH-I): JH 410/50, Z 3325/70 and I 105/50¹.

II. Research activity and results

For participation in the competition Milena Karailieva presented 3 monographs (1 of them habilitation work), 4 parts of monographs, 3 articles, 1 study, 16 papers (5 of them in English) and 2 textbooks (1 of them electronic) or in total 31 publications with a total volume of **1809** pages².

Papers accepted for review include: **3 monographs** (B/3, G/4 1-2), 1 textbook (E/20 1), **3 parts of monographs** (G/10 2-4), (one of which is co-authored G/10 4), **1 study** (G/9 1), **16 reports** (G/7 1-9) (one of which is co-authored (G/7 10), 5 of which are in English (G/7 12- 16). Their total volume is **1583** pages.

For the most part, these publications have been published by academic publishers and have been promoted through book distribution and library book publishing, and reviewed by habilitated teachers. Of all **24** publications, only **5** are in a foreign language.

¹ Self-assessment report according to Appendix 2 of the Academic Staff Development Ordinance with minimum requirements for the academic position of associate professor

² See List of publications and creative achievements after defending the doctoral thesis 2005-2020

The following 5 publications were not accepted for evaluation: **1 part of a monograph**³ (G/10 1), **1 textbook**⁴ (E/20 1) **3 articles**⁵ for the following reasons: the monograph is related to the topic of the dissertation published in 2004 before the public protection, the textbook is multimedia by NBU approved standard for distance learning and was developed on a remunerated project, the three articles are non-scientific and have not been published in scientific journals.

1. Evaluation of the monograph, including evaluation of the scientific and applied contributions of the author

The monograph Human Capital in Tourism has 431 pages and contains an introduction, four chapters, a conclusion, a list of tables and figures, annexes and a bibliography with 121 sources in Bulgarian and foreign languages and Internet sites. **Chapter one** is a **general theoretical framework for human capital in tourism**, in which an attempt is made to distinguish basic concepts in scope and set of dimensions: "human capital", "human resources" and "human potential", to follow the evolution of the concept of human capital and thereby derive its role by linking quality and productivity with the company's competitive advantage by highlighting the challenges of human capital in tourism, analyzing current trends in tourism company management and human capital management. **Chapter two** focuses on the **management of the tourism company**, with efficiency in managing at all levels linked to the main aspects of leadership in tourism. The development of the theory of human relations requires a new look at the employed in tourism, among them interpersonal relations, manager style, social climate, harnessing the potential of human capital and others. with an emphasis on the role of the manager in the management of the tourism company and its potential ability to guide the behavior of subordinates in the desired direction. The management of the work processes in the tourism company is discussed, with the specifics of management and executive work in tourism focusing on the "human dimensions" of the tourist service. **Chapter three** deals with issues related to **human capital management in the tourism sector** and focuses on measuring and formulating future actions and focusing corporate management on strategies to maximize the value added from people. Management activities - organizational and administrative - are reviewed, with an emphasis on measuring the impact of people and their management on work performance, and proposing innovative strategies, policies and practices to attract and retain quality employees and effectively manage team potential. **Chapter four** presents a number of different **approaches, tactics and strategies for the development of human capital** and the introduction of initiatives aimed at generating knowledge and competencies that support the company's strategy and competitiveness. This chapter addresses questions about the power of motivation based on the relationship between the three dimensions: past, present, and future dimensions in search of ways to effectively manage motivational potential. Training is

³ M. Rybov, S. Mileva, P.Dimitrov, I.Komitski, M. Karailieva, G. Kolev, Y. Popnikolova "Tourism without borders - reengineering and risk management", (Chapter 3. Tourism Reengineering, p. 139-269), New Star, S., 2004

⁴ NBU Multimedia Electronic Textbook on Scheme: BG051P0001-4.3.04 "Development of Electronic Forms of Distance Learning in the Higher Education System", Project BG051P0001-4.3.04-0037 - C0001 "Improving the Distance Learning Quality of the Distance and Distance Learning Center e-learning at New Bulgarian University ", 2013-2015

⁵ Health Tourism, Cultural and Information Guide for Southwestern Bulgaria, Issue no. April 22, 2009

"The High Potential of Anthropogenic Heritage and the Challenges to Cultural Tourism", Euro Region - BG Business and European Integration Magazine Feb 26, 2014

Challenges to Bulgarian Tourism: Summer 2015, Life @ City Magazine, Cultural Information Guide, Issue no. 5 (94), May, 2015

seen as a significant prerequisite for the development of human capital with priority importance for career development and mobility - indicators of competitive advantage. Conflicts in the workplace are analyzed and the root causes are systematized, as well as causes of fluidity are identified, strategies and approaches for their reduction are proposed. The summarized conclusions in the monographic survey based on the in-depth analysis of the studied issues indicate the need for a radical transformation of strategic visions for the management of human capital in tourism.

The assessment of the basic habilitation work highlights a number of **scientific and practical contributions** that contribute to the expansion and deepening of knowledge about human capital in the field of tourism:

1. **A large volume of scientific literature has been reviewed**, outlining the theoretical framework for the issues under study, based on a thorough analysis of the concepts of human capital and interpretation of different views, the peculiarities of this capital in the tourism sector have been examined, taking into account the current trends and in the this context is a sophisticated and advanced terminological apparatus of human capital in tourism.

2. **The tourism sector has been analyzed** and **emphasis** has been placed on emerging competencies, **distinguishing** between general and specific dimensions of human capital, reflecting the specific management competencies in the tourism business, the level of education and management of the tourism company, and on this basis a model of effective use of investment in human capital **is proposed** and a new vision for the development of human potential in tourism.

3. The dependencies that lead to the transformation of knowledge, competences, experience and potential (intellectual, physical and mental) in the direction of constant self-development and cultivation have been **explored**. Human capital problems have been further **developed** and solutions complemented by linking human resource dependencies - human capital - social capital to the concepts of lifelong learning, 'learning organization' and creating conditions for competitive advantage in tourism companies.

4. The role of strategic management in the implementation of the concept of human capital management through activities, methods and approaches that are most closely related to the relevant human capital policies and programs at strategic, tactical and operational level **is justified**; on this basis, a system of human capital measuring instruments has been developed - ethical dimensions, relationships, procedures and interrelations between the individual elements. A model for strategic human capital management, a model of engagement and factors for improving the valuation of human capital **is proposed** in order to limit the availability and retention of quality staff as a global problem in the Tourism sector.

2. Evaluation of contributions in other applied publications (creative performances)

The substantive analysis of the publications (outside the habilitation work) presented by Dr. Milena Karaileva for the current competition finds expression in the differentiation of the scientific knowledge presented in them and the identification of several thematic areas. They can generally be distinguished into **four main groups**:

1. **Resource potential of tourism and specialized tourism** (G/7 10, 13, E/20 1 and G/10 2)
2. **Health tourism (balneological, spa and wellness)** (G/4 1, G/7 1 and G/9 1)
3. **Psychology of tourist behavior** (G/4 2 and G/7 2)
4. **Human resources in tourism** (G/7 3,4,5,6,7,8,12,14,15 and 16, G/10 3, 4)

The first group covers research in the field of tourism related to the management and development of tourism in Bulgaria and the tourism

resource potential as a prerequisite for many specialized types of tourism, the development of tourist destinations and the creation of an integrated tourism product at the meso level. In the publications of this group (2 reports G/7 10 and 13, 1 textbook E/20 1 and 1 chapter of a collective monograph D/10) the issues of natural and anthropogenic tourism resources as well as the tourism resource in Bulgaria in regional aspect. Most of the publications combine the examination and analysis of tourism development in Bulgaria at national and regional level on the basis of the concept of tourist zoning with the consideration of the possibilities for using different types of resources and the development of specialized types of tourism. Although only 3, the publications presented by upgrading address current issues and reflect different approaches and methods for analyzing and evaluating the resource potential in tourism, related to realizing the opportunities for available natural and anthropogenic resources, focused by region. The problems that exist in the formation of regional tourist image are revealed and recommendations are made for the creation of joint tourist products and the promotion of attractions. The interest in the topic is dictated by the richness of natural and anthropogenic resources and the desire to draw the attention of the relevant institutions and stakeholders to the rich and untapped potential of the natural and cultural heritage.

The **second group** of publications in this thematic area (1 independent monograph G/4 1, 1 report D/7 1 and 1 study D/9 1) reveals the results of the candidate's research studies in the field of health tourism and its possibilities for developing specific types of tourism - balneological, spa and wellness. The peculiarities and prerequisites for the emergence and development of these three types of tourism in Bulgaria and the differentiated tourist product offered by them are considered. Prospects for effective and quality health tourism in general are outlined, based on in-depth knowledge of the traditions in its development and in the use of natural resources, its nature and characteristics, tendencies, challenges, which determines the relevance of the chosen topic for the present analysis.

The **third group** of publications (1 separate monograph G/4 2 and 1 report D/7 2) addresses issues related to psychological characteristics, changes in lifestyle and the emergence of new values in the behavior of users of tourist services. tourist behavior, the main characteristics of the behavior of tourist users, as well as the determining factors (economic, political, cultural, social, personal, psychological), the trends in the development of tourist behavior, the defining role of the high quality of the tourist product and the true experiences for the satisfaction of tourists are highlighted. The place of intercultural interaction for the psychological processes that take place during and after the meeting between individuals and groups from different cultural backgrounds is highlighted. The cultural shock of inter-community contacts, the adaptation to new cultures, and the clash between different cultures in tourist destinations are examined. The role of the tourist consumer as a participant in the decision-making process for purchasing in tourism and the models for deciding to buy a new product is emphasized. The relationship between the self-concept and the tourist motivation is explored, which is useful for predicting tourist behavior and for tourism workers who provide information to potential tourists.

The **fourth group** of publications is related to the management and development of human resources (11 reports G/7 3,4,5,6,7,8,12,14,15 and 2 parts of collective monographs, G/10 3, 4). The last thematic area addresses issues related to innovative approaches to human resource management in the context of digitalisation, closely linked to how people are recruited and how their skills are refined to achieve real innovation and require resource targeting in an uncertain and uncertain future, as well as identifying people who are able to think extraordinarily and innovatively, open to new ideas and concepts. Questions about digital transformations in all areas and the impact on the behavior of many

participants in the tourism sector are discussed. Strategic guidelines are outlined, which should include elements of cultural-based creativity, technological innovation and innovation in human resource management.

The mentioned thematic areas outline the contours of the development of scientific knowledge in the professional direction 3.9 Tourism. Decomposing these destinations reveals different levels of depth of knowledge about tourism and enables the creation of topics and publications with varying levels of information workload.

The evaluation of the publications highlights a number of scientific and practical contributions that contribute to the expansion and deepening of knowledge in tourism and the specifics in its development. **In summary, they can be presented as follows:**

1. The diversity and specific features of the recreational-tourist resource potential of Bulgaria **are revealed** and the opportunities for the development of specialized types of tourism **are outlined** and innovative ideas for the development of integrated tourism products **are proposed** at the level of the tourist area.

2. The trends in the development, demand and supply of balneological, spa and wellness services **are analyzed**, the main problems in the sector **are outlined** and the possible prospects for development **are specified**.

3. The tourist demand and supply on a global scale **is examined**, and for this purpose changes in the behavior of tourists **are analyzed** and the dimensions of tourist behavior in the 21st century **are outlined**.

4. **The study of the human factor** in tourism has taken into account the influence of digitalization in this field in an attempt to overcome the intangible nature. **Emphasis is placed** on employee competence and multi-functional management skills in a dynamic organizational environment. Strategies **have been proposed** to increase the value added that is being leveraged by employed people in the tourism sector. The importance of human resources in tourism as the most important strategic asset **is substantiated**.

3. Citation from other authors

According to a reference (G/12)⁶ from the NBU Library: "Citation Analysis CA-17-2019" of publications with author Milena Metodieva Karailieva, it is evident that 14 separate references to publications by the author (**12 citations by other authors** and 2 self-citations) are established.

4. Evaluation of the results of participation in research and creative projects and putting the results into practice

The applicant has participated in national research and research projects in the period 2013-2015, **three in total** (E/16 1-3):

1. As an expert in Project BG051PO001-3.1.07-0039 "Higher Education in Economics - the Basis of the Knowledge Economy", Scheme: BG051PO001-3.1.07 "Updating higher education curricula in accordance with the requirements of the labor market", NBU

2. As the author of a NBU multimedia electronic textbook according to the approved Standard and its annexes in Project BG051PO001-4.3.04-0037 - C0001 "Improving the quality of distance learning of the NBU Distance and E-Learning Center", Scheme: BG051PO001 -4.3.04 "Development of electronic forms of distance learning in the higher education system".

⁶ Table 3. Description of evidence to Appendix 2 "Minimum National and NBU Requirements to the Applicants for Academic Degree and Academic Assistant Professor Position"

3. As a Functional Expert and Academic Mentor on Project BG 051PO001-3.3.07-0002 "Student Practices", MES, NBU

III. Lecturing and teaching activities

The associate professor applicant delivers lecture courses to students from the professional field 3.9 Tourism at the Bachelor's and Master's degrees at NBU. Her main teaching courses are in the following subjects: human resources management and development in tourism, human resources management, tourism management, tourism resources, psychology of tourism behavior, balneology and spa tourism, reengineering of tourism business processes, international strategic tourism marketing, a total of 6 undergraduate and 2 master's courses in full-time education and the same in distance education. (E/30). Most of them are copyrighted teaching materials (E/36 1-5).

1. Auditorial and out-of-class occupation, work in the electronic training module "MOODLE - NBU", provision of student practices and internships, work with students and doctoral students

It is evident from the self-assessment report that the applicant's occupation is much higher than the norm according to the Employment Ordinance (by category auditorial 240 hours, out of class hours 60 hours): 2013/2014 240/420 hours, 2014/2015 132/545 hours, 2015/2016 258/545 hours, 2016/2017 340/510 hours, 2017/2018 325,5/746 hours, 2018/2019 669/440 hours and the applicant's planned occupation for 2019/2020 is 556/480 hours (Z/38).

Milena Karailieva has been a scientific supervisor and reviewer of a large number of students since 2009 after taking a job at NBU⁷ until 2019 as follows: **scientific supervisor** of 36 students, 92 **reviews** of Bachelor's and Master's theses, and **14 times** she was a member of committees for the protection of theses or for the State Examination (Z/38 1-2). She has annually developed internal projects with the NBU for organizing and conducting extracurricular training for students in the specialty "Tourism" (Z/39 1-5).

2. Work with Erasmus students

The application documents submitted by the applicant do not describe any work with Erasmus students.

3. Assessments from student surveys

The documentation⁸ shows that the applicant's assessment by students is high: the average mark for the last five years is Excellent 4.65 from the maximum 5.00 (Z/35 1).

IV. Administrative and community service

1. Participation in the collective governing bodies of the NBU

Dr. Milena Karailieva served as a Program Director/Consultant from 2009 to 2018, participated in the Program Council and the meetings of the Departmental Board as a lecturer (I/44 1-4) and a member of the Accreditation Committee. She has participated in various teams to transform the Bachelor's and Master's Degree Programs in Tourism (J/30 1-4).

⁷ Self-assessment report (long-term assessment report - working with students and participating in committees)

⁸ Information from the Center for Career Development and Training Resources at NBU

2. Social activity

The applicant's social activity is reflected in her membership in the Bulgarian Chamber of Education, Science and Culture (BCESC) and she serves as Director of the Human Resources Management Program since 2011 (J/23).

3. Recruiting students to the program

In the period 2009-2018, Milena Karailieva served as a Program Consultant and participated in candidate-student campaigns to recruit students to NBU.

V. Personal impressions of the applicant

I don't know personally Head Assistant Milena Karailieva, but from the autobiographical report she is seriously engaged in teaching activities since 2005 after receiving her Doctoral Degree Diploma until her admission to the New Bulgarian University. As a part-time lecturer she gave lectures at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski" (Faculty of Economics) and the University of Forestry to students of Bachelor of Arts and Master of Arts in 3.9 "Tourism". She has 9 participations in Scientific-practical conferences, of which 4 are international, 6 are National symposia and 1 is a Round table.

VI. Opinions, recommendations and notes on the applicant's activities and achievements

My recommendation is that in the future, Dr. Milena Karailieva make efforts to reduce her academic load, both as a number of disciplines and as a general workload hierarchy, which will allow her to concentrate her efforts in writing more textbooks and teaching manuals of her disciplines. I also believe that in his future research work, the applicant should extend both the territorial scope and the thematic range of his research. The number of articles is too small. Another recommendation is to promote more widely the scientific output of the applicant abroad.

Conclusion

As a result of the examination of the submitted materials for the competition, no violations of the procedure were found. All requirements, regulated by Art. 24 (1), 27 (4) item 1 and item 2 of the ZRASRB and of Art. 53 (1) (2) and Art. 57 a (2) item 1 and item 2 of the RAPRRSB. The following conclusions can be drawn from the detailed examination of the applicant's documents and the evaluation of the publications submitted by her:

1. In the competition Milena Metodieva Karailieva is the only candidate.
2. She has a PhD degree.
3. She holds the academic position of "Assistant Professor" at New Bulgarian University, which announced the competition
4. She is provided with the necessary auditorial work.
5. The applicant has a published textbook.
6. She lectures in 8 courses at Bachelor's Degree and Master's Degree.
7. She was the scientific advisor of 36 graduates.
8. Sufficient volume, non-doctoral dissertation scientific production, including 24 works, is presented and accepted for evaluation - 3 independent monographs, 3 parts of collective monographs, 1 textbook, 1 studio, 16 papers, 5 of which are in a foreign language.
9. 12 citations of the candidate from other authors have been documented.

Taken together, the peer-reviewed publications of Head Assistant Milena Metodieva Karailieva contains indisputable scientific and practical contributions, which further develop the theoretical knowledge and improve the methodological tools for solving significant problems of tourism. My overall assessment of the criteria and indicators for research, teaching, teaching, administration and community activities shows that Head Assistant Milena Metodieva Karailieva meets the requirements of Art. 24 and Art. 27 of the ZRASRB and Art. 53 and Art. 57a of the RAPRRRB for occupying the academic position of Associate Professor in the professional field 3.9 Tourism (Human Capital in Tourism) and gives me the reason to express a positive attitude towards her application.

Reviewer:

/ Prof. Dr.Sci. Maria Vodenska /

03/23/2020